Workflow Toolkit and Lessons in User Centered Design

Pascale Carayon, PhD
Ben-Tzion (Bentzi) Karsh, PhD
Industrial & Systems Engineering
Center for Quality and Productivity Improvement
University of Wisconsin
Goals of the toolkit

☐ Help small and medium sized practices to
  ■ Analyze their workflows in preparation health IT implementation
  ■ Improves workflows during and post implementation
  ■ Use health IT to further improve workflows
Support activities

- Technical expert panel
- Request for Information
- Literature Review
- Environmental Scan
- User centered design?
Lessons in user centered design

☐ A lot of talk about usability
☐ All of us are designing tools, for some users, to accomplish goals
☐ So all of us should be using user centered design processes
Designs are hypotheses about how artifacts affect cognition

David Woods
Who are the users?

- Small and medium sized practices
  - Physician champions
  - Practice managers
- Regional Extension Centers
- Two levels of expertise
  - Beginners
  - Advanced
Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

The key to successful implementation of health information technology (health IT) is to recognize its impact on both clinical and administrative workflow. Once implemented, health IT can provide information to help you reorganize and improve your workflow.

This toolkit is designed for people and organizations interested or involved in the planning, design, implementation and use of health IT in ambulatory care. The toolkit can help these individuals and organizations by providing resources to better understand:

- what workflow is and why it must be incorporated in planning, design, implementation and use of health IT; more
- what tools are available to use when assessing workflow; more
- the impact of health IT on workflow as experienced by clinical practices; more
- the research on how health IT implementation affects workflow; more
- how health IT can be used to assess and improve workflows; more

Center for Quality & Productivity Improvement
Users?

- REC staff did not exist at the time - so who are they and what do they know?
- What is “advanced” and what is “beginner”?
  - In implementation experience?
  - In stage of implementation?
  - Years of using health IT?
  - In workflow analysis?
  - Can they self-select?
- What about other users?
  - Vendors?
  - Curriculum developers?
User goals

- Learn about workflow and its importance
- Learn how to analyze workflows
- Learn state of evidence regarding workflow and health IT success
Learn about workflow and importance

Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home  ꞉ Workflow 101

- What is workflow?
  Workflow is the sequence of physical and/or mental tasks performed by various people over time and through space. It can occur at different and/or multiple levels (e.g., one person, between people, across organizations) and can occur sequentially and/or simultaneously.
- What must I consider when I think about workflow?
- Why is it important to assess workflow?
  Anytime you make a change to your practice, ESPECIALLY when implementing Health IT, the workflow associated with clinical & practice management processes will change.
- What are consequences of NOT analyzing workflow?
- How do I analyze workflow?
- Who should collect & analyze workflow?
- When should I assess workflow?

[More on Workflow]
Learn about ways to analyze workflow
User goals?

- What users thought *workflow* meant, and therefore expected to learn about was all over the map.

- Our simple *tools* embedded our own assumptions – users still would not know what to use the tools for or how
Users’ needs to achieve goals

- Need to know what tools are available
- How they have been used by others
- Where to learn how to use them
- Strengths and weaknesses of the tools
Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home > Advanced Tools

The more than 100 tools included in this compendium are grouped to at least one of twelve categories based on what they are used for. For example, tools such as flowcharts are a means of "process mapping"; check lists are a type of "data collection" tool, histograms provide "data display/organization," and focus groups are a source of "idea generation." By first selecting a category on this page, you then are provided a list of tools and their short descriptions. Details on each tool including steps on how to use the tool, examples of the tool's use as found in published papers and/or user stories, and more can then be obtained by selecting the specific tool you wish to learn more about.

Data Collection  |  Data Display/Organization  |  Idea Creation  |  Proactive Risk Assessment  |  Problem Solving  
Process Improvement  |  Process Mapping  |  Project Planning/Management  |  Statistical  |  Task Analysis  |  Usability

Health IT
# Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

## Data Collection

Although there are many different tools you can use to collect & analyze workflow information, the following tools, appropriately used, will be extremely useful in helping you better understand current workflows & modify current or design new workflows that will make it easier to use your health IT.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Backlog Reduction Worksheet</td>
<td>......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balanced Scorecard</td>
<td>The balanced scorecard suggests that we view the organization from four perspectives, and to develop metrics, collect do......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Check Sheet</td>
<td>A check sheet is a table or form used for registering data as they are collected. It is a simple, generic tool that can ......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Task Analysis</td>
<td>The purpose of cognitive task analysis is to capture the way the mind works, to capture cognition. The researcher or pre......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Walkthrough</td>
<td>The cognitive walkthrough method is used to evaluate user interface usability. The main driver behind the development of......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group</td>
<td>A focus group brings together up to a dozen people to discuss their attitudes and concerns about a subject......more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td>Interviews collect data (generally qualitative) from a targeted group of people about their opinions, behavior, or know......more</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home  Advanced Workflow  Advanced Tools  Advanced User stories  FAQs  Links

Home » Advanced Tools » Data Collection » Details

REFERENCES

ABSTRACT
This paper reports an experimental study of general practitioners' use of an interactive computerized protocol for the management of hypertension, focusing particularly on the protocol's effects on doctors' clinical behaviour. Prior to its computerization a paper-based version of the protocol was used enabling a comparison of the alternative forms. Doctors' delivery of care was assessed from video recordings of 89 consultations and from the records made during these consultations. Comparisons were made of consultations conducted under control and experimental conditions. Use of paper and computer protocols resulted in significant improvements in the doctors' delivery of care, in terms of the range of verbal and physical examinations conducted and recorded. The protocol's effects were most marked when the computerized version was used. However, use of the computer protocol resulted in the recording of information on the non-occurrence of certain events which had not been explicitly elicited during the verbal examination; features of the design which were intended to encourage adherence to the protocol resulted in the recording of unsubstantiated information. It is concluded that the detail of the verbal examination suggested by the protocol may have been inappropriate to the realities of a general practice consultation. The findings provide some useful insights for the design of future computerized protocols for the management of chronic conditions.

OBJECTIVE
To report an experimental study of general practitioners' use of an interactive computerized protocol for the management of
User needs?

- Our initial design allowed a user to learn about. New design will let them learn how.
- It did not take into account potential time constraints of user in actual practice
- Small and medium sized practices may not have the resources to invest in this kind of learning
User centered design – devil is in the details

☐ User centered design is *NOT* asking users what they want and giving it to them

☐ User centered design is *NOT* designing something, showing it to users and asking “so does this make sense?” / “do you like it?”

☐ User centered design is *NOT* usability

☐ Knowledge about performance and skill to execute UCD is critical
UCD from Mockup to Real Use

- Rapid cycle of user feedback, evaluation, and redesign
- Differences between simulated use and actual use
- Updates
  - Development vs. maintenance
  - User involvement
  - Changing users and user needs
Next hypothesis

- Redesign website to be action oriented, right from the homepage
  - Click here to start analyzing your workflow
  - Click here to learn how to improve your existing workflows

- Make materials readily available
  - Click here to get workflow training materials
  - Click here for workflow curriculum presentations
Larger Challenge

- Users need to know a whole. Each of our toolkits gives a part. [sound like clinical needs and health IT?]

- Bigger question for all of the toolkits is how do we help users to integrate over all of the toolkits to get something useful?
Thank you

http://cqpi.engr.wisc.edu/withit_home
Advanced Workflow (provides guided search of lit review Access database – & may contain user stories if any apply to fields selected)
Advanced Workflow – Search Results (provides reference & objective for each paper/user story; select more and directed to detail of respective output)
Advanced User Stories

Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home > Advanced User Stories

Throughout the design of this toolkit we encountered individuals responsible for or heavily involved in health IT installations from medical practices of varying size, scope, and location. You can read all of their "stories" by selecting SEARCH at the bottom of this page or you can refine your search by selecting one or more options from each of the categories listed here. Subsequently you will we provided a list of summaries for each of the relevant stories; detailed stories can then be read by selecting a specific story you wish to read more about.

TECHNOLOGY
- EHR / EMR
- e-prescribing
- Decision Support
- Alert and Reminder
- Other technologies

CLINIC
- Size
  - Small
  - Medium
  - Large
- Location
  - Urban / Suburban
  - Rural
- Type of Practice
FAQs

Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home > FAQs

Frequently Asked Questions

Why doesn’t this toolkit contain examples of the workflow changes that I can expect?

How do I choose a vendor?
Links

Workflow Integration Toolkit for Health IT

Home
Advanced Workflow
Advanced Tools
Advanced User stories
FAQs
Links

Home > Links

1. Costs and Benefits of (Pediatric) Health Information Technology
2. Doctor’s Office Quality – Information Technology (DOQ-IT)
3. American Academy of Family Physicians: The Center for HIT
4. American College of Physicians: Health Information Technology

The website has an HIT section that focuses on EHR, e-Prescribing, and Physician Quality Reporting Initiative (PQRI). Regarding the EHR, there is a lot of information on implementing it, including a link to an Advance Planning & Workflow Analysis, however it is accessible only to ACP members.

Sources:
http://www.acponline.org/running_practice/technology/
http://www.acponline.org/running_practice/technology/ehr/roadmap/ehr.html#inst
http://www.acponline.org/running_practice/pcmh/help.htm

5. Health Information Technology for Improving Quality of Care in Primary Care Settings
Define users
Determine goals
Identify user cognitive work needs to achieve goals
Design
Test with cognitive walkthroughs
Revise design
Test with use cases and measure outcomes
Revise
Field test
Revise
Search Results (enter key word in “search” box on home page)
Advanced Search (choice located below search box) – provides fields from which to choose; final output looks same as when use “search”